

Toronto Public Library Board

Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.

Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto

Members Present:

Mr. Jonathan Hoss (Vice Chair)

Councillor Paul Ainslie

Mr. Fenton Jagdeo

Councillor Gord Perks

Ms. Andrea Geddes Poole

Mr. Alim Remtulla

Regrets:

Ms. Sue Graham-Nutter (Chair)

Ms. Jennifer Liu

19-171 Call to Order

Jonathan Hoss, Acting Chair, called the meeting to order at 6:00 pm.

Mr. Hoss gratefully acknowledged that the Toronto Reference Library is on Indigenous land. He indicated this is the traditional territory of the Haudenosaunee Confederacy (also known as the Six Nations Confederacy), the Wendat, and the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation. Toronto Public Library gratefully acknowledges these Indigenous nations for their guardianship of this land. Mr. Hoss reminded and reaffirmed as Torontonians and Canadians, accountability to these Indigenous nations, and to all Indigenous peoples and communities living in Toronto.

Mr. Hoss further indicated that this land is also part of the Dish with One Spoon territory, that includes a treaty between the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, the Anishinaabek and allied nations, to peaceably share and care for this land, its waters, and all of the biodiversity in the Great Lakes region. All those who come to live and work here are responsible for honouring this treaty in the spirit of peace, friendship, and respect.

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

19-172 Declarations of Conflicts of Interest

There were no *Declarations of Conflicts of Interest* by members of the Library Board.

19-173 Approval of Agenda

Under Section 15b – New Business from City Librarian, a New Business item – *Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch* – was added to the agenda as an Urgent Matter. Two-thirds of all Board Members present must approve of its introduction.

Moved by Councillor Perks, seconded by Councillor Ainslie:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. approves the addition of a New Business item that is an Urgent Matter regarding a Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch.

Carried

Moved by Councillor Ainslie, seconded by Councillor Perks:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. add 21 Communications items regarding an upcoming community space rental at the Palmerston branch; and
2. add six Presentations regarding a Community Space Rental at the Palmerston Branch and one Presentation regarding the 2020-2029 Capital Budget and Plan – Revised.

Carried

19-174 Confirmation of September 23, 2019 Toronto Public Library Board Meeting Minutes

Moved by F. Jagdeo, seconded by A. Remtulla:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. confirms the minutes of the September 23, 2019 Toronto Public Library Board meeting.

Carried

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

19-175 Confirmation of September 23, 2019 Toronto Public Library Board Closed Meeting Minutes***Moved by*** A. Geddes Poole, ***seconded by*** Councillor Perks:***That*** the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *confirms the minutes of the September 23, 2019 Toronto Public Library Board Closed meeting.*

Carried**19-176 Approval of Consent Agenda Items*****Moved by*** A. Remtulla, ***seconded by*** F. Jagdeo:***That*** the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *approves the consent agenda and all other items not held on consent.*

Carried

Councillor Ainslie expressed appreciation to the Toronto Public Library Foundation for their efforts in raising funds for the Library through events such as Biblio Bash and the Jack Rabinovitch Reading Room.

19-177 Business Arising from the Minutes

There were no *Business Arising from the Minutes* items at the October 22, 2019 meeting.

19-178 City Librarian's Report (*Received for Information by Consent*)***That*** the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *receives the City Librarian's Report for information.*

Carried

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

19-179 Communications**Moved by** Councillor Ainslie, **seconded by** A. Remtulla:**That** the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. receives Communication (a) to Vickery Bowles, City Librarian, Toronto Public Library from Brendan Haley, President, Toronto Public Library Workers Union, Local 4948 dated October 16, 2019 requesting that the Toronto Public Library reconsider its decision to allow an upcoming meeting room booking at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy.
2. receives Communication (b) to Vickery Bowles from Adam Chaleff, dated October 16, 2019 requesting that the Toronto Public Library reconsider its decision to allow an upcoming meeting room booking at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy.
3. receives Communication (c) to Sue Graham-Nutter, Chair, Toronto Public Library Board from David Morris, Board Chair, The 519, dated October 16, 2019 expressing concern that the Toronto Public Library has agreed to host an upcoming event on October 29, 2019 involving Meghan Murphy.
4. receives Communication (d) to TPL Board Members from Malgosia Starszyk dated October 17, 2019 expressing support for the Toronto Public Library's position on freedom of speech and providing access and welcoming spaces to every Canadian, regardless of their views.
5. receives Communication (e) to TPL Board members from Claire Forsyth dated October 17, 2019 requesting the Toronto Public Library cancel an upcoming event at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy.
6. receives Communication (f) to Sue Graham-Nutter and Board members from Dr. Toni Samek, Professor and Chair, School of Library and Information Studies, University of Alberta dated October 17, 2019 expressing support for Toronto Public Library's decision to allow a third-party to rent a theatre for an event at Toronto Public Library.
7. receives Communication (g) to Vickery Bowles, copying the Toronto Public Library Board from Chris Winsor dated October 17, 2019 expressing support for allowing the upcoming event at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy to proceed.
8. receives Communication (h) to Members of the TPL Board from Caitlin Belle dated October 20, 2019 expressing discomfort with the upcoming room rental to Meghan Murphy.

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

Communications – continued

9. *receives Communication (i) to Toronto Public Library Board members from Susan Benton, President and CEO, Urban Libraries Council dated October 21, 2019 expressing support for the Library's refusal to compromise its values or diminish its role as a leader for race and social equity.*
10. *receives Communication (j) to the Toronto Public Library Board from Cara Faith Zwibel, Director, Fundamental Freedoms Program, Canadian Civil Liberties Association dated October 21, 2019 expressing support for the Library's decision to honour the third-party room rental booking to a group hosting Meghan Murphy.*
11. *receives Communication (k) to the Toronto Public Library Board from Pilar Martinez, Chair, Canadian Urban Libraries Council and CEO, Edmonton Public Library, on behalf of: Alvin M. Schrader, Professor Emeritus School of Library and Information Studies, University of Alberta and members of the Canadian Urban Libraries Council dated October 18, 2019 expressing support for the Library's decision to allow a third-party to rent a theatre for an event at Toronto Public Library.*
12. *receives Communication (l) to Vickery Bowles, c/o the Library Board from Ed Gibbard dated October 18, 2019 expressing support for her decision to allow the upcoming event at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy to proceed.*
13. *receives Communication (m) to Sue Graham-Nutter from James L. Turk, Director, Centre for Free Expression, Ryerson University dated October 18, 2019 expressing support for allowing the upcoming event at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy to proceed.*
14. *receives Communication (n) to the Toronto Public Library Board from Melissa Hudson, Advocate, Trans Women's Association dated October 20, 2019 requesting that an upcoming event at the Library with Meghan Murphy be cancelled and ensuring no such event is booked in the future.*
15. *receives Communication (o) to Members of the Toronto Public Library Board from Greg Gatenby in defence of free speech.*
16. *receives Communication (p) to the Toronto Public Library Board from Dawn Miklaski dated October 20, 2019 expressing appreciation for supporting freedom of speech in Canadian libraries.*

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

Communications – continued

17. *receives Communication (q) to the Toronto Public Library Board from a group of librarians and library workers dated October 21, 2019 requesting that an upcoming event at the Library with Meghan Murphy be cancelled.*
18. *receives Communication (r) to Members of the Toronto Public Library Board from Dr. Anne Wilson, Professor, Fellow, Canadian Institute for Advanced Research, Successful Societies program, Psychology Department, Wilfrid Laurier University dated October 21, 2019 expressing support for allowing the upcoming event at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy to proceed.*
19. *receives Communication (s) to the Board of the TPL from Catherine Barley dated October 19, 2019 expressing support for allowing the upcoming event at the Palmerston branch with Meghan Murphy to proceed.*
20. *receives Communication (t) to Sue Graham-Nutter from Canadian Parents of Trans and Gender Diverse Kids, Admin Team Members dated October 22, 2019 requesting that an upcoming event at the Library with Meghan Murphy be cancelled.*
21. *receives Communication (u) to the Toronto Public Library Board from Alix-Rae Stefanko, Chair, Canadian Federation of Library Associations dated October 22, 2019 expressing support for the Toronto Public Library's decision to uphold Intellectual Freedom.*

Carried**Presentations****19-180****Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch**

As scheduled, the following individuals addressed the Board speaking against the community space rental at the Palmerston branch:

- Olivia Nuamah, Executive Director, Pride Toronto
- Christin Milloy, Board Member, Pride Toronto
- Jane Schmidt.
- David Morris, Board Chair, The 519
- Pam Hrick, Board Member, The 519
- Thane Tweyman
- Patience Newbury

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

Presentations – continued**Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch – continued**

As scheduled, the following individual addressed the Board speaking in support of the community space rental at the Palmerston branch:

- Rosemary Frei

Additionally, the following individuals addressed the Board speaking against the community space rental at the Palmerston branch:

- Daniel K.
- Gwen B.
- Niko S.
- Caitlin N.
- Zoe Whittall, on behalf of Canadian Parents of Trans and Gender Diverse Kids
- Michelle N.
- Christin E.
- Freya P. (provided a petition with 430 signatures requesting cancellation of the community space rental at Palmerston branch)
- Kristin W.
- Scott D.
- Anton C.
- Jade C.

Additionally, the following individuals addressed the Board speaking in support of the community space rental at the Palmerston branch

- Eva P.
- Christine (distributed materials to the Board from Radical Feminists Unite)
- Jane M.

Jonathan Hoss expressed appreciation to all individual speakers and speakers representing organizations for their remarks.

Moved by A. Geddes Poole, seconded by Councillor Ainslie:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *receives the Presentations regarding Agenda Item No. 10a – Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch for information.*

Carried

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

Presentations – continued**19-181 Notice of Amendment – Toronto Public Library Board Procedural By-law**

Derek Moran spoke against the revisions to the Board's Procedural By-law as outlined in the *Notice of Amendment – Toronto Public Library Board Procedural By-law* report. He believes the Board is restricting freedom of expression by limiting presentations to the Board to five minutes in total.

Moved by A. Geddes Poole, seconded by F. Jagdeo:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. receives the presentation from Derek Moran regarding Agenda Item No. 12 – Notice of Amendment – Toronto Public Library Board Procedural By-law for information.

Carried

Items for Information:**19-182 Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch**

Jonathan Hoss acknowledged members of the public in the boardroom with signs in support of transgender rights.

In response to questions from Board members, Vickery Bowles provided the following information:

- (a) a third-party group requested a room booking for an event featuring speaker Meghan Murphy.
- (b) The stated purpose of the meeting was “to have an educational and open discussion on the concept of gender identity and its legislation ramifications on women in Canada.”
- (c) Vancouver Public Library held an event with a similar purpose for the same speaker, and the content of that event was considered by TPL staff.
- (d) The third-party group are obligated by contract not to violate TPL's policies, the Criminal Code of Canada or the Ontario Human Rights Code.

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch – continued

- (e) A senior library manager will be in attendance at the event to monitor it.
- (f) The City Librarian's decision is final regarding the right to deny or cancel a booking.
- (g) In 2017, the Library's Community and Event Space Rental Policy was reviewed by external legal counsel, which included an additional peer review of the external legal counsel's legal memorandum and the policy by an Osgoode Hall constitutional lawyer in the context of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms.

On several occasions the Chair requested that order be maintained in the room.

Moved by Councillor Perks, seconded by A. Remtulla:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. receives the Community Space Rental at Palmerston Branch report for information.

Carried

19-183 Toronto Public Library Board Education – Access to eContent for Public Libraries - Update

Susan Caron, Director, Collections and Membership Services, reviewed highlights of the report for the Board.

Moved by F. Jagdeo, seconded by A. Remtulla:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. receives the Toronto Public Library Board Education – Access to eContent for Public Libraries – Update report and presentation for information.

Carried

19-184 Notice of Amendment – Toronto Public Library Board Procedural By-law

Moved by Councillor Perks, seconded by F. Jagdeo:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. receives the Notice of Amendment – Toronto Public Library Board Procedural By-law for information.

Carried

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

19-185 TPL Design-Forward Thinking Branch Capital Projects

Moe Hosseini-Ara, Director, Branch Operations and Customer Experience, introduced Gail Rankin, Senior Manager, Facilities Management and Susan Martin, Manager, Branch Capital Plan & Implementation.

Ms. Rankin and Ms. Martin provided the Board with information regarding the ways in which the Library has achieved design excellence in its capital projects. Factors in this success include the Library's planning framework, including the Service Delivery Model, Facilities Master Plan, Strategic Plan, Digital Strategy and Spaces Vision, that provides the overall context for the development of TPL's capital program. The principles that are followed when undertaking a major Library capital project include welcoming public space, vision, flexibility, durability and sustainability.

Moved by A. Remtulla, **seconded by** F. Jagdeo:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. receives the TPL Design-Forward Thinking Branch Capital Projects verbal report for information.

Carried

19-186 Motion to Extend the Meeting

At 8:45 p.m., it was:

Moved by Councillor Ainslie, **seconded by** A. Remtulla:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. extends the meeting until the completion of the agenda.

Carried

19-187 Motion to Defer Items on the Agenda

Moved by Councillor Perks, **seconded by** A. Geddes Poole:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. defers the following items on the agenda to the November 25, 2019 Toronto Public Library Board meeting to ensure quorum is maintained:
 - a. Google IT Support Professional Certificate
 - b. 2020 Operating Budget – Update.

Carried

Toronto Public Library Board**Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

19-188 Toronto Public Library Board – 2020 Proposed Meetings and Locations Schedule (Received for Information by Consent)*That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

1. receives the Toronto Public Library Board – 2020 Proposed Meetings and Locations Schedule for information.

Carried**19-189 Board Resolutions – Status Report (Received for Information by Consent)***That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

1. receives the Board Resolutions – Status Report for information.

Carried**Items for Approval:****19-190 2020-2029 Capital Budget and Plan – Revised**

Larry Hughsam, Director, Finance and Treasurer, reviewed highlights of the report for the Board.

Moved by Councillor Perks, seconded by A. Geddes Poole:*That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

1. approves the revised 2020-2029 capital budget and plan submission of \$27.825 million debt (\$45.011 million gross) for 2020 and \$430.647 million debt (\$532.795 million gross) over 2020-2029, comprised of:
 - 1.1 28 projects, as detailed in Attachment 1, totalling \$26.616 million debt (\$43.802 million gross) in 2020 and \$330.812 million debt (\$432.960 million gross) over 2020-2029, which reflects TPL's Capacity to Spend Capital Budget and Plan; and
 - 1.2 4 projects, as detailed in Attachment 2, totalling \$1.209 million debt and gross in 2020 and \$99.835 million debt and gross over 2020-2029 that reflects TPL's Capital Needs Constraints.

Carried

Toronto Public Library Board

Meeting No. 8: Tuesday, October 22, 2019, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:55 p.m.

Toronto Reference Library, Boardroom, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto

19-191 Janitorial Services Contract Extension

Moved by A. Geddes Poole, seconded by F. Jagdeo:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *extends the TBM contract for janitorial services for one (1) additional year at a total cost of \$2,784,028, excluding HST.*

Carried

19-192 Biblio Bash at the Toronto Reference Library – Thursday, April 23, 2020

(Approved by Consent)

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *approves the request from the Toronto Public Library Foundation to host the 2020 Biblio Bash gala fundraiser at the Toronto Reference Library on Thursday, April 23, 2020, including closure of the second floor on the day of the event and full closure of the branch as of 12:30 p.m. on April 23, 2020.*

Carried

19-193 Holiday Closures 2020 and January 2021 (Approved by Consent)

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *approves the schedule of holiday closures for 2020 and January 2021 as provided in Attachment 1.*

Carried

19-194 Adjournment

Moved by Councillor Perks, seconded by A. Remtulla:

That the Toronto Public Library Board:

1. *adjourns the October 22, 2019 Toronto Public Library Board meeting.*

Carried

The meeting ended at 8:55 p.m.

Signed: _____