

Cleaning Services – A Report in Response to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee Motions of December 8, 2008

Date:	February 25, 2009
To:	Employee and Labour Relations Committee
From:	Director, Information Technology & Facilities

SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to respond to the Employee and Labour Relations Committee request of staff to explore options for incremental implementation of the contracting in of cleaning services, to report on how the model could address safety concerns and to cost the model based on the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives “living wage”.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

This information report has no financial impact. There is no provision in the 2009 operating budget for the incremental costs resulting from contracting in of cleaning services.

The Director, Finance & Treasurer has reviewed this Financial Impact Statement and is in agreement with it.

DECISION HISTORY

At the December 8, 2008 meeting of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee, Library staff presented a report that included a version (“Revised Union Proposal”) of the Union Costing Option #2 that addressed three issues: cleaning services on Saturdays and Sundays, adequate relief staff to cover for absences, management and supervision. The report also expressed concern about the safety issues of staff working alone in library facilities. The Employee and Labour Relations Committee requested additional information, reflected in the motions below.

That the Employee and Labour Relations Committee:

1. Requests staff to explore options for incremental implementation of the contracting in of cleaning services at the Toronto Public Library by region, branch type and partial year.
2. Requests staff to report on how the model could address the safety concerns identified in the report.
3. Requests staff to cost the model based on the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives “living wage”.

This report responds to the motions.

COMMENTS

Library staff have analyzed the options for incremental implementation of the contracting in of cleaning services, have prepared a model that addresses safety concerns and also prepared a costing based on the Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives “living wage”.

All options and cost models are based on 2008 salaries and the 2009 contract costs for janitorial services. While costs for the second and third year of the cleaning contract are known, the salary costs for 2009 and future years are not set. Salary costs for 2008 are used for all future years. Contract costs for 2009 are used for all future years.

Incremental implementation & addressing safety concerns

Two incremental implementation models have been prepared: by type of branch and by region. In both models, implementation begins with a partial year, 3 months (October to December) of cleaning service by in-house staff. In the subsequent year, the 3 month cost is annualized and the next phase begins with another partial implementation of 3 months. The timing takes into account the annual operating budget approval in March/April.

The two models have been prepared with different timelines for full implementation. In each model the timelines could be adjusted. The different timelines will give a sense of the budget impact of extending or contracting the timelines.

The cost reductions in the contracted cleaning services are based on cost information presented in the RFP proposal from the current contractor. No attempt has been made to estimate costs for years outside the terms of the current contract.

Library staff analyzed the staffing model for the “Revised Union Proposal” and identified those times when staff would be scheduled to work alone in a library location. In each of those instances, part-time staffing was added to the model to improve staff safety by ensuring that staff would not be working alone.

Implementation by Branch Type*					
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Total
Contract cleaning cost	1,471,231	1,471,231	1,471,231	1,471,231	
Contract cleaning cost reduction due to in-house cleaning	(80,869)	(513,786)	(1,050,069)	(1,471,231)	
In-house cleaning cost	257,460	1,282,351	4,040,017	5,418,606	
Cost increase due to in-house cleaning	176,591	768,565	2,989,947	3,947,375	
Annual Operating Budget Increase	176,591	591,974	2,221,382	957,428	3,947,375

* Implementation by branch type: Year 1 starts with Toronto Reference Library and North York Central, Year 2 adds 17 district libraries and 3 large libraries, Year 3 adds remaining locations

Implementation by Region							
	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	Total
Contract cleaning cost	1,471,231	1,471,231	1,471,231	1,471,231	1,471,231	1,471,231	
Contract cleaning cost reduction due to in-house cleaning	(47,793)	(325,615)	(615,001)	(840,335)	(1,138,822)	(1,471,231)	
In-house cleaning cost	508,483	1,656,788	2,815,485	3,957,439	4,836,285	5,418,606	
Cost increase due to in house cleaning	460,690	1,331,173	2,200,484	3,117,104	3,697,463	3,947,375	
Annual Operating Budget Increase	460,690	870,484	869,310	916,620	580,360	249,912	3,947,375

The implementation by region model has been prepared to show the opportunity to spread the budget impact over a greater number of years.

Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives “living wage”

The Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives sets the living wage for a family with two children and two parents employed full-time and year-round, for Toronto at \$16.60 per hour. Calculating the implementation model shows that the difference in costs is lower by approximately \$857,104 per year at full implementation. While this is an interesting point of comparison, the Committee is reminded that wages for Library staff are determined through negotiation with CUPE Local 416. The Custodian position and wage rate at the City is \$20.35 per hour (2008 rate) and this is the rate being proposed by the Library Division.

CONTACT

Ron Dyck; Director, Information Technology & Facilities; Tel: 416-393-7104;
E-mail: rdyck@torontopubliclibrary.ca

SIGNATURE

Jane Pyper
City Librarian