



To: Toronto Public Library Board – December 3, 2001

From: City Librarian

Subject: **Malvern Capital Project – Architectural Services**

Purpose:

To request Toronto Public Library Board approval to award a contract for architectural services for the Malvern District Library capital project.

Funding Implications and Impact Statement:

The Malvern capital project was approved in 2001 with a project total of \$5.2 million. The cost of architectural services will be accommodated within the capital project budget.

Recommendation:

It is recommended that the Toronto Public Library Board approve the award of architectural services for the Malvern capital project to the overall highest scoring proponent, Phillip H. Carter Architect and Kingsland & Architects Inc., (in joint venture), with a contract value of \$272,315, including GST.

Background:

Toronto Public Library received approval from City Council in the 2001 Capital Budget to renovate the existing Malvern facility and expand it by 10,000 square feet for a total size of 25,000 square feet. The Malvern District Library shares space with a busy community recreation centre in the north-east sector of the former Scarborough. When it opened in 1982, it served a population of 24,000. The branch was designed to serve a population of 50,000 residents. Malvern's current population is 147,000 and is one of the highest growth areas of the City. Increased circulation activity is an indication of the dramatic changes in demographics and the increased demand for service. Year to date, circulation is 17 percent higher over the same period last year, while the system average is eight percent. The renovation and expansion of Malvern ensures adequate library service is provided to this high-growth community.

Comments:

The Request for Proposal (RFP) process used for this project is based on the City's proposed *Policy for the Selection and Hiring of Consulting Services* that will be before Council on December 4, 2001. The evaluation procedure and scoring techniques used for this selection complies with the process described in the City's policy. (See Attachment for the relevant

section from the Policy.) The two-envelope system as described in the proposed *Policy for the Selection and Hiring of Professional and Consulting Services* was used in this process.

Toronto Public Library placed an ad in the *Daily Commercial News* inviting responses to the RFP. A total of 16 submissions was received by the Bid Committee on November 8, 2001. The submissions (the first envelope of the two-envelope system) were scored using the evaluation criteria identified in the Request for Proposal document with the result that eight firms were short-listed for an interview and presentation. All short-listed firms attended a mandatory site orientation meeting followed by interviews and presentations the subsequent week. Point scores from the RFP submission and the interview/presentation were tabulated for each proponent.

As part of the two-envelope process, a “service and fee control” approach was used to evaluate the bid submissions (the second envelope). Proponents were asked to submit bids using a combination of costing elements (hourly rate, fixed costs and percentage of construction costs). Firms were then evaluated based on a cost-per-point basis. The firm with the lowest cost-per-point is the overall highest scoring proponent. In this case, the firm with the lowest cost-per-point is Phillip H. Carter Architect and Kingsland & Architects Inc.

Conclusion:

It is recommended that the Library Board approve the award of contract for architectural services for the Malvern renovation project to Phillip H. Carter Architect and Kingsland & Architects Inc., the highest scoring proponent with a contract value of \$272,315, including GST.

Contact:

Vickery Bowles, Director, East Region; Tel: 416-396-8811; Fax: 416-396-8769;

E-mail: vbowles@tpl.toronto.on.ca

Bruce Barnett, Senior Manager, Facilities; Tel: 416-395-5880; Fax: 416-395-5916;

E-mail: bbarnett@tpl.toronto.on.ca

David Clark, Manager, Purchasing; Tel: 416-393-7033; Fax: 416-393-7115;

E-mail: dclark@tpl.toronto.on.ca

City Librarian

List of Attachments:

Extract from Report No. 11 of the Administration Committee which was before the Council of the City of Toronto at its meeting held on July 24, 25 and 26, 2001 – Policy for the Selection and Hiring of Professional and Consulting Services; Use of Consultants and Expenditure Reduction Strategies; and Hiring of Professional and Consulting Services Review