

**Materials Review Committee  
Reconsideration of Materials Summary – 2009**

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Feb 2009	<p><b>Ying Zai Qi Dian (Win at the Starting Blocks: The First Analytical Case Study Report on Early Childhood Education)</b></p> <p>Xingwang Zhou, Women &amp; Life, 2002 Adult Book Written in Chinese</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Contains untrue facts and unscientific theory</li> <li>• Promotes author's business</li> <li>• Remove from collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The book promotes many controversial theories on pregnancy, birth and child rearing that are at odds with standard medical theory and practice.</li> <li>• It also promotes a specific line of products from a physician whose credentials and claims have been challenged.</li> <li>• <b>Withdrawn from the collection.</b></li> </ul>
Mar 2009	<p><b>The Krakow Ghetto and the Plaszow Camp Remembered</b></p> <p>Written by Malvina Graf, Florida State University Press, 1989 Adult Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Author is biased against Polish citizens in wartime Krakow</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The book is an account of the author's personal experience in the Warsaw ghetto, and the descriptions of anti-Semitic activities are accordingly harsh and difficult to read.</li> <li>• It is important as a record of the times and as source material, as evidenced by its inclusion in many North American university and public libraries and its recommendation by resource centres such as the U.S. Holocaust Memorial Museum.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult collection.</b></li> </ul>

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
June 2009	<p><b>Hand, Hand, Fingers, Thumb</b></p> <p>Written by Al Perkins and illustrated by Eric Gurney, Random House, 1969, 1998 Children's Picture Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Promotes discrimination by associating African-American culture and music with monkeys</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The book is part of a series developed to familiarize children with reading through the illustration of body parts and rhymes using animals, e.g. <i>The Nose Book</i> (dogs), an anthropomorphic device with a long tradition in children's literature.</li> <li>• This title focuses on hands playing musical instruments and uses monkeys to illustrate the rhymes, presenting them positively as lively, humorous and possessing manual dexterity.</li> <li>• The author and illustrator have produced numerous children's books, and this title is held by libraries worldwide.</li> <li>• The committee did not find an association with black culture or any attempt to discriminate against African-Americans.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the children's collection.</b></li> </ul>
July 2009	<p><b>The Story of Seabiscuit</b></p> <p>Written by John Taintor Foote and directed by David Butler, 1949, 2003 Children's DVD</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Portrays people of black and Asian heritage in an inappropriate and stereotypical manner</li> <li>• Not suitable for children</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Stars Shirley Temple, one of most popular actresses of the time, and includes archival footage of champion racehorse Seabiscuit.</li> <li>• The committee found that the film does contain racial stereotypes typical of the period in which it was made, and is not a children's film because of the romantic plot and adult characters.</li> <li>• It is of historical interest because of the archival footage and continues to have high circulation.</li> <li>• <b>Retained and transferred to the adult collection.</b></li> </ul>

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Sept 2009	<p><b>Hooking Up with Tila Tequila: A Guide to Love, Fame, Happiness, Success and Being the Life of the Party</b></p> <p>Written by Tila Tequila, Scribner, 2008 Adult Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Suspect literary quality and example of soft-core pornography</li> <li>• Advice provided is shallow and other resources are available on topic</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The author is a self-made web and reality television celebrity with a high profile especially among young people.</li> <li>• The book is an example of material that the Library has a mandate to provide: contemporary materials of current interest, reflecting varying points of view.</li> <li>• It is in demand and has circulated well since its acquisition.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult collection</b></li> </ul>
Dec 2009	<p><b>An Anthology of Graphic Fiction, Cartoons and True Stories</b></p> <p>Edited by Ivan Brunetti, Yale University Press, 2006 Adult Graphic Book</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Two stories in collection are offensive because they feature the sexual exploitation of children</li> <li>• Remove from the collection</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Graphic books are a popular and important format, covering many genres and written for adults, children and teens.</li> <li>• Adult graphic books contain mature themes and the immediacy and visual impact of the illustrations may be powerful and disturbing; they are shelved in the adult collection.</li> <li>• The book was well-reviewed in major sources, e.g. the Globe &amp; Mail and New York Times, is held in many North American public and academic libraries and can be purchased in major bookstores.</li> <li>• The two stories cited are by respected and award-winning women graphic novelists who write from their own experiences, revealing the terrible impact of abuse, but also focusing on the victims' survival.</li> <li>• The Materials Selection Policy acknowledges that material selected to fill the needs of some users may, on occasion, be offensive to others. The Library recognizes the right of an individual to reject material for personal use but not to restrict the right of others to access it.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult collection.</b></li> </ul>

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
Nov 2009	<p><b>Adbusters: Journal of the Mental Environment</b></p> <p>Adult Magazine</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Article “Never Again” and others have anti-Israel slant</li> <li>• Not social satire, as magazine claims itself to be, but anti-Semitism</li> <li>• Questions whether budget well spent on magazine</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Adbusters</i> is one of the most respected alternative journals, recommended by <i>Library Journal</i> for collections on sustainability and environmental activism.</li> <li>• The magazine publishes articles on current issues from its particular viewpoint along with parody ads (it carries no advertising), and fits into the Library’s mandate to provide materials that represent varying points of view and reflect current conditions and controversies.</li> <li>• “Never Again” is a serious look at a socio-political issue and not intended as satire.</li> <li>• <b>Retained in the adult collection.</b></li> </ul>