

**Materials Review Committee
Reconsideration of Materials Summary – 2006**

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
January 2006	<p>1. The Speeches of Malcolm X 1997</p> <p>Videocassette (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In one speech there is an implication that the “mark of the beast” in the Bible refers to white people. Promotes racism, violence and has a negative influence on people. • Reserve for research purposes only. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The speeches in the video show the evolution of Malcolm X from his early militant stage, from which this comment is taken, to his later belief in the possibility of world brotherhood. As original source material from an historically significant leader, this video of Malcolm X’s speeches is valuable to both students and customers with an interest in the subject. • Retained in the adult video collection
March 2006	<p>2. The Adventures of Barry Ween Boy Genius Written and illustrated by Judd Winick 1999</p> <p>Teen Graphic Book (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains foul language and sexual imagery. • Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The author is a well-known graphic novelist and this book won an award from the Young Adult Library Services branch of the American Library Association. Graphic books are very popular with youth and we acquire them particularly to appeal to this audience. • Retained in the teen graphic book collection

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
May 2006	<p>3. Dinner with a Perfect Stranger: an Invitation Worth Considering By David Gregory 2004</p> <p>Adult Large Print Book (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Jesus character is depicted as expressing scorn for other world religions. This may fall under the Criminal Code definition of hate propaganda and is inflammatory. • Withdraw and replace with a good devotional book. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is not uncommon for religious writers to state that other religions lack the truth of their own, e.g. C.S. Lewis. The inclusion of these works in the collection upholds the principle of intellectual freedom. • The Criminal Code exempts those who express an opinion on a religious subject in good faith. • Retained in the adult fiction collection
June, 2006	<p>4. Maxim for Men</p> <p>Adult Magazine (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Borderline pornographic and degrades women. • Should not be on the same floor as teens and children. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Maxim</i> is a popular lifestyle magazine directed at a male audience between the ages of 18 and 34. It is similar to glossy style magazines such as <i>Cosmopolitan</i> or <i>Elle</i>, catering to a similar female market. Articles cover health, holidays, sports, technology, investing, fashion and sex. It is with the adult periodicals. • Retained in the adult periodicals collection
June 2006	<p>5. Capturing the Friedmans directed by Andrew Jarecki c2003</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deals with explicit child pornography and could be traumatizing to young people. • Should be available only to adults or withdrawn. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The documentary details a family's destruction over allegations of pedophilia. The subject is difficult but handled in a non-sensational manner. It won the best documentary award at the Sundance Film Festival and was nominated for an Academy

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
	Adult DVD 14A (OFRB rating) (English)		Award. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The 14A rating means that is shelved in the adult collection and children under 14 are prevented from borrowing it by the Library's circulation system. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Retained in the adult DVD collection
September 2006	6. The Prince Dethroned by A.J. West 2005 Adult Fiction (English)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Book is homophobic and no distinction is made between homosexuals and pedophiles. Publisher is not reputable publishing company but prints books on demand. Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> On reading the book, staff found derogatory statements about homosexuals, often equating them with pedophiles. There was no redeeming value to the book as the plot and characterization were weak, serving only to support the author's views on the modern Catholic Church. The committee researched the publisher, PublishAmerica, and found that its practice of accepting and printing on demand any manuscript it receives does not meet the Library's standard of a reputable publisher. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Withdrawn from the collection
September 2006	7. Divine Intervention Directed by Elia Suleiman 2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Film's depiction of Israeli soldiers is anti-Israel and intent is to provoke anti-Israeli feelings. Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Elia Suleiman is Palestine's foremost director. This film won a number of awards including the Critics' Prize at the Cannes Film festival. Reviewers praised it for its depiction of both Israelis and Palestinians locked in an absurd

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
	Adult DVD (Hebrew)		but tragic situation. • Retained in the adult DVD collection
October 2006	8. Crank by Ellen Hopkins 2004 Teen Fiction (English)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotes use of crank (methamphetamine) and is inappropriate for teens. • Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The author is an internationally-recognized writer of children’s and teen books who has been nominated for the National Book Award among others. Rather than promoting the use of methamphetamine, the book shows its devastating impact. It is not only well-written but deals with themes of interest to youth and is popular even with reluctant readers. • Retained in the teen fiction collection
October 2006	9. Sarah Silverman: Jesus is Magic 2006 Adult DVD 14A (OFRB rating) (English)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Undermines sexual mores and norms of society and is anti-Christian. • Have a rabbi review the film. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sarah Silverman is a well-known television and film actor and stand-up comic who practises a currently popular form of extreme comedy. While not for everyone, the DVD is in demand and has circulated well since its receipt. • Following the Library’s procedure for dealing with concerns about items in the collection, librarians reviewed the DVD objectively using their professional expertise. • Retained in the Adult DVD collection

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
November 2006	<p>10. Margaret Cho: Revolution 2004</p> <p>Adult DVD (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pornographic. • Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Margaret Cho is a well-known actor, comic and social activist. The DVD is a film of her stand-up act. The DVD cover clearly describes the contents as “frank, explicit... and raunchy”. While not for everyone, it is in demand and has circulated very well since its receipt. • No Ontario Film Review Board rating was available so the DVD was not labeled, however, a 14A rating will be applied so children cannot borrow it. • Retain in the collection with 14A rating
November 2006	<p>11. Animorphs: The Next Passage By K.A. Applegate 2000</p> <p>Children’s Fiction (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Violent content. Will make lonely children turn to violence. • Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Animorphs</i> is a very popular science fiction series that was awarded the Publishers’ Weekly best Children’s Series Award. • Retain in the Children’s Fiction collection
November 2006	<p>12. Zombie Butts from Uranus By Andy Griffiths 2003</p> <p>Children’s Fiction (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Violent content. Teaches children that being rude and vulgar is funny. • Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This is a very popular comic children’s book that won an Australian children’s book award and was on the New York Times bestseller list. • Retain in the Children’s Fiction collection

Date	Item Description	Summary of Customer Comments	Findings and Action Taken
	<p>13. Undercover Girl #2: Fugitive By Christine Harris 2004</p> <p>Children's Fiction (English)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Violent content. The cover sexualizes a young girl. • Withdraw. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • This book is part of a popular mystery series nominated for the American Library Association's list of best books for reluctant readers. • Retain in the Children's Fiction collection