

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto****Members Present:**

Councillor Paul Ainslie (Chair)

Mr. Michael Foderick (Vice Chair)

Councillor Janet Davis

Councillor Sarah Doucette

Mr. Stephen Dulmage

Ms. Kimberley Korinek

Mr. Cameron MacKay

Councillor Cesar Palacio

Councillor Jaye Robinson

Mr. Kenneth Stewart

Mr. Benjamin Wulffhart

Ms. Andrea Zammit

**Regrets:**

Mr. Ross Parry

**12-025 Call to Order**

Councillor Paul Ainslie called the meeting to order at 6:05 p.m.

**12-026 Declarations of Conflicts of Interest**

There were no Declarations of Conflicts of Interest by members of the Library Board.

**12-027 Approval of Agenda***Moved by K. Stewart, seconded by Councillor Davis, and carried:**That the Toronto Public Library Board approves the agenda as revised to:*

1. *add a Presentation under Agenda Item No. 8 from Rami Tabello on behalf of the Toronto Public Space Initiative regarding Agenda Item No. 10 – Advertising Policy and Program;*
2. *add additional Communication items; and*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Approval of Agenda – continued**

3. *move Agenda Item No. 13 – Appeal of Exclusion by Customer, which is confidential, to immediately following Agenda Item No. 16 – Approved Minutes of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee Meeting of November 17, 2011, to avoid disruption in the public portion of the meeting.*

**12-028 Confirmation of January 30, 2012 Toronto Public Library Board Meeting Minutes*****Moved by K. Stewart, seconded by K. Korinek, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *confirms the Minutes of the January 30, 2012 Toronto Public Library Board meeting.*

**12-029 Confirmation of January 30, 2012 Toronto Public Library Board Closed Meeting Minutes*****Moved by Councillor Doucette, seconded by B. Wulffhart, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *confirms the Minutes of the January 30, 2012 Toronto Public Library Board Closed meeting.*

**12-030 Business Arising**

There were no Business Arising items at the February 27, 2012 meeting.

**12-031 Chair's Report**

Councillor Ainslie noted the following items:

- a. Freedom to Read Week – February 26 to March 3;
- b. Book Lover's Ball on February 9<sup>th</sup>;

Councillor Ainslie commented on an online reference on the Toronto Public Library Workers Union, Local 4948 website to the privatization of the Toronto Public Library. He advised that there are no plans for privatization of the Toronto Public Library.

***Moved by S. Dulmage, seconded by C. MacKay, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *receives the Chair's Report for information.*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**12-032 Presentations**

Rami Tabello addressed the Board on behalf of the Toronto Public Space Initiative concerning Agenda Item No. 10 – *Advertising Policy and Program*. He requested that the Board consider not adopting the recommendations as outlined in the report.

***Moved by M. Foderick, seconded by Councillor Palacio and carried:***

***That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *receives Rami Tabello's presentation concerning Agenda Item No. 10 – Advertising Policy and Program for information.*

**12-033 Communications**

***Moved by S. Dulmage, seconded by K. Korinek, and carried:***

***That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *receives the following Communication items (a) – (e) for information:*
  - (a) *Communication from Joe Clark dated February 20, 2012 requesting to address the Board at the April 2, 2012 meeting on the following issues:*
    - i. *Board member accountability in response to statements and actions by Board members during the city budgetary process;*
    - ii. *Statements of principle reaffirming bedrock library principles called into dispute by Board members and city councillors;*
    - iii. *Rejection of outside interference, including by elected officials and a newspaper columnist, in materials selections and policy;*
  - (b) *Communication from Joe Clark dated February 24, 2012 regarding Correction to January 2012 Minutes;*
  - (c) *Communication from Joe Clark dated February 24, 2012 regarding Invitation to Test RFID Self-checkout;*
  - (d) *Communication from Joe Clark dated February 24, 2012 regarding Misinformation about Library DVD Collections;*
  - (e) *Communication from Joe Clark dated February 24, 2012 regarding Advertising at the Toronto Public Library; and*
2. *denies Joe Clark's request to address the Board in person, and requests that he submit his ideas regarding (a) in writing to the Board Chair.*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Items for Approval:****12-034 Advertising Policy and Program**

Linda Hazzan, Director, Communications, Programming & Customer Engagement provided the Board with an overview of the proposed Advertising Policy.

The Board adopted the following motion as amended:

***That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *approves the attached Advertising Policy (Attachment 1);*
2. *approves the recommended implementation approach to the advertising program in two phases:*
  - i. *Phase 1 to consist of the expansion of the current What's On publication advertising program and the implementation of advertising on the reverse side of Library date due slips; and*
  - ii. *Phase 2 to consist of the contracting of the services of an external advertising and media consultant to assess all Library channels and vehicles for their appropriateness and financial viability for an advertising program, and make recommendations to the Library on how best to proceed to maximize revenue and minimize impacts to the delivery of core library services;*
3. *appoints Cameron MacKay and Benjamin Wulffhart to the Advertising Review Working Group; and*
4. *approves changes to related Toronto Public Library Board policies as outlined in this report and in Attachments 2 and 3.*
5. *refers to the City Librarian consideration of the addition of 10(i) [The Library will NOT accept the following types of advertising content:] "promotion of products and services that are targeted to children" to the policy, and to report back to the Board at the end of Phase 1.*

**MOTIONS:**

***Moved by K. Korinek, seconded by Councillor Palacio, and carried:***

***That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *approves the attached Advertising Policy (Attachment 1);*
2. *approves the recommended implementation approach to the advertising program in two phases:*
  - i. *Phase 1 to consist of the expansion of the current What's On publication advertising program and the implementation of advertising on the reverse side of Library date due slips; and*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Advertising Policy and Program – continued**

- ii. Phase 2 to consist of the contracting of the services of an external advertising and media consultant to assess all Library channels and vehicles for their appropriateness and financial viability for an advertising program, and make recommendations to the Library on how best to proceed to maximize revenue and minimize impacts to the delivery of core library services;*
  - 3. appoints Cameron MacKay and Benjamin Wulffhart to the Advertising Review Working Group; and*
  - 4. approves changes to related Toronto Public Library Board policies as outlined in this report and in Attachments 2 and 3.*

Recorded Vote Requested:

Yes – 10

Councillor Paul Ainslie, Stephen Dulmage, Michael Foderick, Kimberley Korinek, Cameron MacKay, Councillor Cesar Palacio, Councillor Jaye Robinson, Ken Stewart, Benjamin Wulffhart, Andrea Zammit.

No – 2

Councillor Janet Davis, Councillor Sarah Doucette.

*The motion as amended was carried.***Moved in amendment by Councillor Davis, seconded by Councillor Doucette, and defeated:****That the Toronto Public Library Board:**

- 5. defers consideration of the Advertising Policy and Program report to the April 2, 2012 Board meeting to allow for greater public input.*

Recorded Vote Requested:

Yes – 2

Councillor Janet Davis, Councillor Sarah Doucette.

No – 10

Councillor Paul Ainslie, Stephen Dulmage, Michael Foderick, Kimberley Korinek, Cameron MacKay, Councillor Cesar Palacio, Councillor Jaye Robinson, Ken Stewart, Benjamin Wulffhart, Andrea Zammit.

*This amendment to the motion was defeated.*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Advertising Policy and Program – continued**

*Moved in amendment by Councillor Davis, seconded by Councillor Doucette, and defeated:*

*That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

6. *requests the Medical Officer of Health to make a presentation to the April 2, 2012 Board meeting on advertising to children in Canada.*

Recorded Vote Requested:

Yes – 5

Councillor Janet Davis, Councillor Sarah Doucette, Ken Stewart, Benjie Wulffhart, Andrea Zammit.

No – 7

Councillor Paul Ainslie, Stephen Dulmage, Mike Foderick, Kim Korinek, Cameron MacKay Councillor Cesar Palacio, Councillor Jaye Robinson.

*This amendment to the motion was defeated.*

*Moved in amendment by Councillor Davis, seconded by Councillor Doucette, and defeated:*

*That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

7. *deletes language in the policy under “scope” including, but not limited to, publications, websites, video screens, trucks and other spaces identified by the Library”;*

Recorded Vote Requested:

Yes – 2

Councillor Janet Davis, Councillor Sarah Doucette

No – 10

Councillor Paul Ainslie, Stephen Dulmage, Michael Foderick, Kimberley Korinek, Cameron MacKay, Councillor Cesar Palacio, Councillor Jaye Robinson, Ken Stewart, Benjamin Wulffhart, Andrea Zammit

*This amendment to the motion was defeated.*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Advertising Policy and Program – continued**

*Moved in amendment by M. Foderick, seconded by Councillor Palacio, and carried:*

*That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

8. *refers to the City Librarian consideration of the addition of 10(i) [The Library will NOT accept the following types of advertising content:] “promotion of products and services that are targeted to children” to the policy, and to report back to the Board at the end of Phase 1.*

Recorded Vote Requested:

Yes – 11

Councillor Paul Ainslie, Councillor Doucette, Stephen Dulmage, Michael Foderick, Kimberley Korinek, Cameron MacKay, Councillor Cesar Palacio, Councillor Jaye Robinson, Ken Stewart, Benjamin Wulffhart, Andrea Zammit.

No – 1

Councillor Janet Davis.

*This amendment to the motion was carried.*

At the request of Councillor Davis, the Toronto Board of Health's report on Advertising to Children will be distributed to Board members.

**12-035 Lobbying of Library Board Members**

*Moved by Councillor Doucette, seconded by K. Korinek, and carried:*

*That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

1. *approves the Lobbying of Library Board Members Policy (Attachment 1).*

*Moved in amendment by Councillor Davis, seconded by M. Foderick, and carried:*

*That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

2. *requests the City Librarian to record all Lobby Disclosure Forms and Proposal Discussion Memoranda on the Toronto Public Library website as part of the policy.*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Lobbying of Library Board Members – continued*****Moved in amendment by M. Foderick, seconded by B. Wulffhart, and defeated:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

3. *requests the City Librarian to report back on the feasibility of including in the policy:*
  - i. *unions;*
  - ii. *senior staff at the Library.*

The motion as amended was *carried*.

**12-036 Displaying and Distributing Information for the Public Policy*****Moved by Councillor Doucette, seconded by Councillor Robinson, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *approves a change to the Displaying and Distributing Information for the Public Policy as highlighted below and in Attachment 1; and*
2. *approves changes to the Municipal Election Campaign Policy as outlined in this report and in Attachment 2.*

**Items for Information:****12-037 Security Measures at Toronto Public Library*****Moved by K. Stewart, seconded by Councillor Doucette, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *receives the Security Measures at Toronto Public Library report for information.*

In response to a request, staff will provide Councillor Davis with information regarding any changes after security incidents at the Main and City Hall branches in 2010 and 2011.

**12-038 Toronto Public Library Board Members – Expenses Paid for 2011*****Moved by Councillor Doucette, seconded by C. MacKay, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *receives the Toronto Public Library Board Members – Expenses Paid for 2011 report for information.*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Employee and Labour Relations Committee:****12-039 Approved Minutes of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee Meeting of November 17, 2011*****Moved by Councillor Davis, seconded by K. Stewart, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *receives the Employee and Labour Relations Committee: Approved Minutes of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee Meeting of November 17, 2011 verbal report for information.*

**12-040 Closed Meeting**

At 8:20 p.m., it was:

***Moved by A. Zammit, seconded by B. Wulffhart, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *conducts a Closed meeting as the subject matters being considered are personal matters concerning an identifiable individual and labour relations or employee negotiations.*

At 9:50 p.m. the Board resumed its meeting in public.

**Confirmation of Closed Meeting Decision****12-041 Appeal of Exclusion by Customer*****Moved by Councillor Palacio, seconded by B. Wulffhart, and carried:******That the Toronto Public Library Board:***

1. *receives the Appeal of Exclusion by Customer for consideration;*
2. *informs the individual, in writing, of the Board's decision; and*
3. *requests that the confidential information provided in the appeal not be made public as it relates to personal information about an identifiable individual.*

**Toronto Public Library Board****Meeting No. 2: Monday, February 27, 2012, from 6:05 p.m. to 9:55 p.m.****Toronto Reference Library, Board Room, 789 Yonge Street, Toronto**

---

---

**Confirmation of Closed Meeting Decision****12-042 Employee and Labour Relations Committee: Approved Minutes of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee Closed Meeting of November 17, 2011***Moved by K. Korinek, seconded by K. Stewart, and carried:**That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

1. *receives the Employee and Labour Relations Committee: Approved Minutes of the Employee and Labour Relations Committee Closed Meeting of November 17, 2011 for information; and*
2. *requests that the confidential information provided in the approved minutes not be made public as it relates to labour relations or employee negotiations.*

**Confirmation of Closed Meeting Decision****12-043 Employee and Labour Relations Committee: February 24, 2012 Meeting Update***Moved by Councillor Palacio, seconded by A. Zammit, and carried:**That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

1. *receives the Employee and Labour Relations Committee: February 24, 2012 Meeting Update verbal report for information; and*
2. *requests that the confidential information provided in the verbal report not be made public as it relates to labour relations or employee negotiations.*

**12-044 Adjournment***Moved by Councillor Doucette, seconded by K. Korinek, and carried:**That the Toronto Public Library Board:*

1. *adjourns the February 27, 2012 Toronto Public Library Board meeting.*

The meeting ended at 9:55 p.m.

Signed: \_\_\_\_\_